

# Tax Analysis

PRC Tax

Authors:

Shanghai

Leonard Khaw, Partner  
Tel: +86 21 6141 1498  
Email: [lkhaw@deloitte.com.cn](mailto:lkhaw@deloitte.com.cn)

Hong Ye, Partner

Tel: +86 21 6141 1171  
Email: [hoye@deloitte.com.cn](mailto:hoye@deloitte.com.cn)

Helen Cheng, Manager

Tel: +86 21 6141 1129  
Email: [hcheng@deloitte.com.cn](mailto:hcheng@deloitte.com.cn)

For more information, please contact:

International Tax Services  
National and Eastern Region  
Shanghai

Vicky Wang, Partner  
Tel: +86 21 6141 1035  
Email: [vicwang@deloitte.com.cn](mailto:vicwang@deloitte.com.cn)

Northern Region  
Beijing

Kevin Ng, Partner  
Tel: +86 10 8520 7501  
Email: [keving@deloitte.com.cn](mailto:keving@deloitte.com.cn)

Southern Region  
Hong Kong

Sharon Lam, Partner  
Tel: +852 2852 6536  
Email: [shalam@deloitte.com.hk](mailto:shalam@deloitte.com.hk)

## SAT issues guidance on beneficial ownership of dividends under tax arrangement with Hong Kong

China's State Administration of Taxation (SAT) issued guidance on 12 April 2013 (*Shuizonghan* [2013] No. 165 (Circular No. 165)) in response to enquiries from various provincial and city SAT offices as to whether certain Hong Kong companies should be regarded as beneficial owners of dividends received for purposes of the tax arrangement between Mainland China and Hong Kong. Although Circular No. 165 is addressed to the relevant local SAT offices, the guidance is expected to be followed generally by all tax authorities in China with respect to the application of similarly worded dividends articles in China's other tax treaties.

Circular No. 165 clarifies rules issued in 2009 and 2012 which provided guidance on whether a resident of a contracting state should be considered the beneficial owner of particular items of income under the dividend, interest and royalties articles of China's tax treaties (Circular No. 601 and Bulletin No. 30, respectively). Circular No. 165, which provides guidance on the application and interpretation of the relevant provisions of the previous guidance in relation to dividends, was formulated on the basis of internal SAT studies and consultation with the Hong Kong Inland Revenue Department.

### Interpretation of Circular No. 601

For a nonresident to benefit from reduced withholding tax rates on dividends, interest and royalties under Chinese tax treaties, the nonresident must be considered the "beneficial owner" of the income. Circular No. 601 defines the term beneficial owner and sets out a number of "negative factors" that could affect a nonresident's status as a beneficial owner. Circular No. 165 addresses the following negative factors set out in Circular No. 601, in relation to dividends:

- 1) *Article 2(1): The applicant is obliged to distribute or pay the entire or most (such as above 60%) of the income within the prescribed time period (such as within 12 months of the date of receipt of income) to a resident of a third country (or area).*

Circular No. 165 focuses on the words "obliged to distribute ... to a resident of a third country" and the relationship between the nonresident applicant and its immediate parent company. According to Circular No. 165, consideration of the Circular No. 601 factor is irrelevant if the applicant does not distribute its "profits" to a non-Hong Kong resident enterprise. However, if it does distribute profits to a non-Hong Kong immediate parent company,

the applicant must submit documentary evidence about its obligation to make such distributions, including any contractual obligations. The responsible tax authorities should formulate their conclusions on this adverse factor based on the evidence provided.

Circular No. 165 may be read to imply that this Circular No. 601 negative factor is irrelevant in determining the beneficial owner status of a Hong Kong resident enterprise which distributes its profits only to other Hong Kong resident enterprises, e.g., a Hong Kong company which is wholly-owned by another Hong Kong company.

- 2) *Article 2(2): Other than the rights or property from which the item of income is derived, the applicant has no, or hardly has any, other business activities.*

Circular No. 165 clearly states that the existence of this single negative factor should, in and of itself, not disqualify an applicant from being regarded as the beneficial owner of dividends. Circular No. 165 clarifies that the phrase "business activities" includes "investing in the shares in respect of which the dividends are received," and the phrase "has no, or hardly has any, other business activities" is intended to catch companies whose only investment and business operations relates to the shares in respect of which the dividends received.

- 3) *Article 2(3): In the case where the applicant is an entity such as a corporation, its assets, scale of business, and personnel deployment are comparatively small (or small), and not commensurate with its income.*

Circular No. 165 specifies that the tax authorities should not merely focus on the single factors enumerated, e.g., the number of employees employed by the applicant or whether the applicant pays those individuals; and should not equate the applicant's "assets" with its registered capital. All relevant facts are to be considered, including:

- How the applicant is funded, as well as the level of risk it bears in relation to its investments; and
- The nature of the work performed by, and the role and responsibilities of, the employees of the applicant.

- 4) *Article 2(4): With respect to the item of income, or the property or right from which that item of income is derived, the applicant has no or minimum right to control or dispose of, nor does it bear any risks.*

Circular No. 165 focuses on the words: "has no or minimum right to control or dispose of, nor does it bear any risks." The tax authorities should not conclude that the applicant does not possess the right to control or dispose of its investments merely because the applicant is wholly owned by its immediate parent company.

In deciding whether the applicant possesses the right to control or dispose of its investments, the tax authorities should focus on the following factors:

- Whether the provisions of relevant legal documents grant the applicant such rights;
- Whether the applicant has exercised such rights; and
- Whether the exercise of such rights was at the discretion of the applicant.

- 5) *Article 2(5): The relevant income is non-taxable or exempted by the other contracting state (or area); or, if being taxable, the effective tax rate is extremely low.*

The fact that Hong Kong does not tax offshore source income should not be the "key factor" in deciding that the applicant is not the beneficial owner of the dividends received.

#### Interpretation of Bulletin No. 30

Bulletin No. 30 clarifies the determination of beneficial owner under China's tax treaties and introduces a listed company safe harbor, which simplifies the definition of beneficial owner to the extent recipients of dividends are qualifying listed companies or group companies. Circular No. 165 provides guidance on the application and interpretation of the listed company safe harbor. Article 3 of Bulletin No. 30 provides as follows:

*"If a resident of the other contracting state ("the applicant") applies for preferential tax treatments of China-sourced dividends under a DTA, it can be recognized directly as a beneficial owner, provided that it is a company listed in the other contracting state or is 100% owned directly or indirectly by a company listed in the other contracting state which is also a resident of the other contracting state (excluding cases where the shares of the applicant are indirectly held by the listed company through a resident company of a third state which is a resident of neither China nor the other contracting state)."*

Circular No. 165 clarifies that this safe harbor rule is meant to provide preferential treatment in relation to listed company groups located in relevant treaty jurisdictions, in this case, Hong Kong. The safe harbor is not meant to be applied to disqualify applicants that do not satisfy the conditions of the safe harbor from being regarded as beneficial owners of dividends received; in particular:

- An applicant that is directly or indirectly wholly owned by an unlisted Hong Kong resident company; and
- An applicant that, although ultimately controlled by a Hong Kong company, is immediately owned by an intermediate holding company that is located in a third jurisdiction.

#### Other

Circular No. 165 also stipulates that the treatment accorded an applicant for treaty benefits should be consistent among the relevant tax authorities responsible for the companies from which dividends are received by the applicant.

Taxpayers may apply for its beneficial ownership status to be reassessed in the event of substantial changes in its business.

#### Comments

The additional guidance and clarification provided by Circular No. 165 are welcome. The circular addresses many, although not all, of the issues and questions that have been encountered by taxpayers applying for treaty benefits. The comments in Circular No. 165 that all relevant facts and circumstances should be considered, and no one negative factor, of itself, should disqualify the applicant from being regarded as beneficial owner, as well as the stipulation the treatment of a taxpayer should be consistent across different tax bureaus, are especially welcome.

The guidance may be regarded as part of the SAT's efforts to respond to the need for more certainty and improve consistency in taxpayer treatment. It is hoped that such efforts on the part of the SAT will continue.

Note: Contents discussed in this Tax Analysis pertains to Deloitte International Tax Services

Tax Analysis is published for the clients and professionals of the Hong Kong and Chinese Mainland offices of Deloitte China. The contents are of a general nature only. Readers are advised to consult their tax advisors before acting on any information contained in this newsletter. For more information or advice on the above subject or analysis of other tax issues, please contact:

#### Beijing

Kevin Ng  
Partner  
Tel: +86 10 8520 7501  
Fax: +86 10 8518 7501  
Email: [kevnng@deloitte.com.cn](mailto:kevnng@deloitte.com.cn)

#### Hong Kong

Sarah Chin  
Partner  
Tel: +852 2852 6440  
Fax: +852 2520 6205  
Email: [sachin@deloitte.com.hk](mailto:sachin@deloitte.com.hk)

#### Shenzhen

Constant Tse  
Partner  
Tel: +86 755 3353 8777  
Fax: +86 755 8246 3222  
Email: [contse@deloitte.com.cn](mailto:contse@deloitte.com.cn)

#### Chongqing

Claude Gong  
Partner  
Tel: +86 23 6310 6206  
Fax: +86 23 6310 6170  
Email: [clgong@deloitte.com.cn](mailto:clgong@deloitte.com.cn)

#### Jinan

Eunice Kuo  
Partner  
Tel: +86 531 8518 1058  
Fax: +86 531 8518 1068  
Email: [eunicekuo@deloitte.com.cn](mailto:eunicekuo@deloitte.com.cn)

#### Suzhou

Frank Xu / Maria Liang  
Partner  
Tel: +86 512 6289 1318 / 1328  
Fax: +86 512 6762 3338  
Email: [frakxu@deloitte.com.cn](mailto:frakxu@deloitte.com.cn)  
[mliang@deloitte.com.cn](mailto:mliang@deloitte.com.cn)

#### Dalian

Frank Tang  
Partner  
Tel: +86 411 8371 2888  
Fax: +86 411 8360 3297  
Email: [ftang@deloitte.com.cn](mailto:ftang@deloitte.com.cn)

#### Macau

Quin Va  
Partner  
Tel: +853 8898 8833  
Fax: +853 2871 3033  
Email: [quiva@deloitte.com.hk](mailto:quiva@deloitte.com.hk)

#### Tianjin

Jason Wu  
Partner  
Tel: +86 22 2320 6680  
Fax: +86 22 2320 6699  
Email: [jassu@deloitte.com.cn](mailto:jassu@deloitte.com.cn)

#### Guangzhou

Constant Tse  
Partner  
Tel: +86 20 8396 9228  
Fax: +86 20 3888 0121  
Email: [contse@deloitte.com.cn](mailto:contse@deloitte.com.cn)

#### Nanjing

Frank Xu  
Partner  
Tel: +86 25 5791 5208  
Fax: +86 25 8691 8776  
Email: [frakxu@deloitte.com.cn](mailto:frakxu@deloitte.com.cn)

#### Wuhan

Justin Zhu  
Partner  
Tel: +86 27 8526 6618  
Fax: +86 27 8526 7032  
Email: [juszhu@deloitte.com.cn](mailto:juszhu@deloitte.com.cn)

#### Hangzhou

Qiang Lu  
Partner  
Tel: +86 571 2811 1901  
Fax: +86 571 2811 1904  
Email: [qilu@deloitte.com.cn](mailto:qilu@deloitte.com.cn)

#### Shanghai

Eunice Kuo  
Partner  
Tel: +86 21 6141 1308  
Fax: +86 21 6335 0003  
Email: [eunicekuo@deloitte.com.cn](mailto:eunicekuo@deloitte.com.cn)

#### Xiamen

Lynch Jiang  
Partner  
Tel: +86 592 2107 298  
Fax: +86 592 2107 259  
Email: [ljiang@deloitte.com.cn](mailto:ljiang@deloitte.com.cn)

#### About the Deloitte China National Tax Technical Centre

The Deloitte China National Tax Technical Centre ("NTC") was established in 2006 to continuously improve the quality of Deloitte China's tax services, to better serve the clients, and to help Deloitte China's tax team excel. The Deloitte China NTC prepares and publishes "Tax Analysis", "Tax News", etc. These publications include introduction and commentaries on newly issued tax legislations, regulations and circulars from technical perspectives. The Deloitte China NTC also conducts research studies and analysis and provides professional opinions on ambiguous and complex issues. For more information, please contact:

#### National Tax Technical Centre

E-mail: [ntc@deloitte.com.cn](mailto:ntc@deloitte.com.cn)

#### Eastern Region

Leonard Khaw  
National Leader & Partner  
Tel: +86 21 6141 1498  
Fax: +86 21 6335 0003  
Email: [lkhaw@deloitte.com.cn](mailto:lkhaw@deloitte.com.cn)

#### Northern Region

Angela Zhang  
Partner  
Tel: +86 10 8520 7526  
Fax: +86 10 8518 1326  
Email: [angelazhang@deloitte.com.cn](mailto:angelazhang@deloitte.com.cn)

#### Southern Region

Davy Yun  
Partner  
Tel: +852 2852 6538  
Fax: +852 2520 6205  
Email: [dyun@deloitte.com.hk](mailto:dyun@deloitte.com.hk)

If you prefer to receive future issues by soft copy or update us with your new correspondence details, please notify Wandy Luk by either email at [wanluk@deloitte.com.hk](mailto:wanluk@deloitte.com.hk) or by fax to +852 2541 1911.

#### About Deloitte

Deloitte refers to one or more of Deloitte Touche Tohmatsu Limited, a UK private company limited by guarantee, and its network of member firms, each of which is a legally separate and independent entity. Please see [www.deloitte.com/cn/en/about](http://www.deloitte.com/cn/en/about) for a detailed description of the legal structure of Deloitte Touche Tohmatsu Limited and its member firms.

Deloitte provides audit, tax, consulting, and financial advisory services to public and private clients spanning multiple industries. With a globally connected network of member firms in more than 150 countries, Deloitte brings world-class capabilities and high-quality service to clients, delivering the insights they need to address their most complex business challenges. More than 200,000 Deloitte professionals are committed to becoming the standard of excellence.

#### About Deloitte in Greater China

We are one of the leading professional services providers with 21 offices in Beijing, Hong Kong, Shanghai, Taipei, Chongqing, Dalian, Guangzhou, Hangzhou, Harbin, Hsinchu, Jinan, Kaohsiung, Macau, Nanjing, Shenzhen, Suzhou, Taichung, Tainan, Tianjin, Wuhan and Xiamen in Greater China. We have nearly 13,500 people working on a collaborative basis to serve clients, subject to local applicable laws.

#### About Deloitte China

In the Chinese Mainland, Hong Kong and Macau, services are provided by Deloitte Touche Tohmatsu, its affiliates, including Deloitte Touche Tohmatsu Certified Public Accountants LLP, and their respective subsidiaries and affiliates. Deloitte Touche Tohmatsu is a member firm of Deloitte Touche Tohmatsu Limited (DTTL).

As early as 1917, we opened an office in Shanghai. Backed by our global network, we deliver a full range of audit, tax, consulting and financial advisory services to national, multinational and growth enterprise clients in China.

We have considerable experience in China and have been a significant contributor to the development of China's accounting standards, taxation system and local professional accountants. We provide services to around one-third of all companies listed on the Stock Exchange of Hong Kong.

This publication contains general information only, and none of Deloitte Touche Tohmatsu Limited, its member firms, or their related entities (collectively the "Deloitte Network") is by means of this publication, rendering professional advice or services. Before making any decision or taking any action that may affect your finances or your business, you should consult a qualified professional adviser. No entity in the Deloitte Network shall be responsible for any loss whatsoever sustained by any person who relies on this publication.