



Global Business Tax Alert

Sharp Insights

In the case of ¹Palam Gas Service, the Apex Court of India has held that expense disallowance on account of non-withholding or non-deposit of tax withheld, would be triggered even if the payment has already been made.

Issue no: GBTA/40/2017

In this issue:

[Background/ Facts](#)
[Issue for consideration before Apex Court](#)
[Ruling of the Apex Court](#)
[Conclusion](#)
[Do you know about Dbriefs?](#)
[Contacts](#)

Background/ Facts

- The taxpayer was engaged in the business of purchase and sale of LPG cylinders.
- It sub- contracted the work for transportation of LPG to three persons for which total payment of INR 20,97,689 was made without withholding any tax on the same.
- The assessing officer ('AO') disallowed the corresponding expenditure claimed by the taxpayer in its tax return under Section 40(a)(ia) of the Income-tax Act, 1961 ('Act'), on the ground that the taxpayer has not withheld any tax on the same under Section 194C of the Act.
- The taxpayer preferred an appeal before Commissioner of Income Tax (Appeals) ('CIT(A)') who confirmed the order of the AO. The Income Tax Appellate Tribunal ('ITAT') also concurred with the view taken by the CIT (A).
- The High Court dismissed the appeal of the taxpayer affirming the order of the ITAT.

Issue for consideration before Apex Court

Since the word used under Section 40(a)(ia) is 'payable', whether the provisions of Section 40(a)(ia) shall be attracted when the amount is not 'payable' but has actually been paid.

Ruling of the Apex Court

- It is the statutory duty of the taxpayer to withhold tax and deposit it to the account of the government within the time specified under the law.
- The provisions which cast an obligation on the taxpayer to withhold tax also begin with the phrase 'shall' making it mandatory to withhold tax.
- Grammatically, it may be accepted that the two words, i.e. 'payable' and 'paid', denote different meanings. When the entire scheme of obligation to withhold tax and paying it over to the Central Government is read holistically, it cannot be held that the word 'payable' occurring in Section 40(a)(ia) refers to only those cases where the amount is yet to be paid and does not cover the cases where the amount is actually paid².
- The intention behind introduction of Section 40(a)(ia) is to recover tax from the taxpayer. Therefore it cannot be held that the word 'payable' occurring in Section 40(a)(ia) refers to only those cases where the amount is yet to be paid and does not cover the cases where the amount is actually paid.

¹Supreme Court approved Punjab & Haryana High Court decision in 'P.M.S. Diesels & Ors. v. Commissioner of Income Tax – 2, Jalandhar & Ors.' [2015] 374 ITR 562 and Calcutta High Court decision in 'Commissioner of Income Tax v. Crescent Export Syndicate' [2013] 216 Taxman 258 (Calcutta). Decision of Allahabad High Court in 'CIT v. Vector Shipping Services (P.) Ltd.' [2013] 38 taxmann.com 77 overruled.

Conclusion

The Apex Court has settled the controversy arising from differing High Court decisions and has given a purposive interpretation to the provisions of Section 40(a)(ia) of the Act.

Do you know about Dbriefs?

Dbriefs are live webcasts that give valuable insights on important developments affecting your business. To register, visit the [Dbriefs](#) page



Download the report



Contacts

Ahmedabad

19th Floor, Shapath - V
SG Highway,
Ahmedabad – 380 015.
Tel: + 91 (079) 6682 7300
Fax: + 91 (079) 6682 7400

Coimbatore

Shanmugha Manram
41, Race Course,
Coimbatore
Tamil Nadu - 641018
Tel: + 91 (0422) 439 2801
Fax: +91 (0422) 222 3615

Kolkata

Bengal Intelligent Park Building
Alpha, 1st floor, Block EP and GP
Sector V, Salt Lake Electronics
Complex,
Kolkata - 700 091.
Tel : + 91 (033) 6612 1000
Fax : + 91 (033) 6612 1001

Bangalore

Deloitte Centre, Anchorage II,
100/2, Richmond Road,
Bangalore 560 025.
Tel: +91 (080) 6627 6000
Fax: +91 (080) 6627 6010

Delhi/Gurgaon

Building 10,
Tower B, 7th Floor,
DLF Cyber City,
Gurgaon 122 002
Tel : +91 (0124) 679 2000
Fax : + 91 (0124) 679 2012

Mumbai

Indiabulls Finance Centre,
Tower 3, 28th Floor,
Elphinstone Mill Compound,
Senapati Bapat Marg, Elphinstone
(W),
Mumbai – 400013
Tel: + 91 (022) 6185 4000
Fax: + 91 (022) 6185 4101

Chennai

No.52, Venkatanarayana Road,
7th Floor, ASV N Ramana Tower,
T-Nagar,
Chennai 600 017.
Tel: +91 (044) 6688 5000
Fax: +91 (044) 6688 5050

Hyderabad

1-8-384 and 385, 3rd Floor,
Gowra Grand S.P.Road,
Begumpet,
Secunderabad – 500 003.
Tel: +91 (040) 6603 2600
Fax: +91 (040) 6603 2714

Pune

106, B-Wing, 7th Floor,
ICC Trade Tower,
Senapati Bapat Road,
Pune – 411 016.
Tel: + 91 (020) 6624 4600
Fax: +91 (020) 6624 4605



Deloitte makes an impact that matters

Deloitte refers to one or more of Deloitte Touche Tohmatsu Limited, a UK private company limited by guarantee, and its network of member firms, each of which is Deloitte refers to one or more of Deloitte Touche Tohmatsu Limited, a UK private company limited by guarantee ("DTTL"), its network of member firms, and their related entities. DTTL and each of its member firms are legally separate and independent entities. DTTL (also referred to as "Deloitte Global") does not provide services to clients. Please see www.deloitte.com/about for a more detailed description of DTTL and its member firms.

This material and the information contained herein prepared by Deloitte Touche Tohmatsu India LLP (DTTI LLP) is intended to provide general information on a particular subject or subjects and is not an exhaustive treatment of such subject(s). This material contains information sourced from third party sites (external sites). DTTL LLP is not responsible for any loss whatsoever caused due to reliance placed on information sourced from such external sites. None of DTTL LLP, Deloitte Touche Tohmatsu Limited, its member firms, or their related entities (collectively, the "Deloitte Network") is, by means of this material, rendering professional advice or services. This information is not intended to be relied upon as the sole basis for any decision which may affect you or your business. Before making any decision or taking any action that might affect your personal finances or business, you should consult a qualified professional adviser.

No entity in the Deloitte Network shall be responsible for any loss whatsoever sustained by any person who relies on this material.

©2017 Deloitte Touche Tohmatsu India LLP. Member of Deloitte Touche Tohmatsu Limited